

Assignment #9-key.

- 1.(a) $\exists x Lmx \Rightarrow_q T$. There is at least one x -variant of q that makes Lmx true; namely, the x -variant that assigns x to *Juliet*.
- (b) $(\exists x Lmx \supset Lmn) \Rightarrow_q T$. Since the consequent Lmn is true under q , the conditional is true under q .
- (c) $\forall x(Gx \supset \exists y Lxy) \Rightarrow_q T$. All x -variants of q make the consequent $\exists y Lxy$ true (all 4 ways of assigning x to a member of the domain make $\exists y Lxy$ true because all four members of the domain stand in the L relation to some other member), Thus all x -variants of q make the conditional $(Gx \supset \exists y Lxy)$ true. Thus q makes the universal $\forall x(Gx \supset \exists y Lxy)$ true.
- (d) $\exists x(Fx \wedge \forall y(Gy \supset Lxy)) \Rightarrow_q F$. There are no x -variants of q that make $(Fx \wedge \forall y(Gy \supset Lxy))$ true. There are 4 x -variants, but only two are relevant here: the one that assigns x to Romeo and the one that assigns x to Benedick (because only Romeo and Benedick have the F property). But it's not true that, in addition to having the F property, Romeo also loves everyone with the G property (i.e., he does love Juliet, but he doesn't love Beatrice). And it's not true that, in addition to having the F property, Benedick also loves everyone with the G property (i.e., he does Beatrice, but he doesn't love Juliet).

$$\begin{array}{l}
 2(a) \quad \forall x(Fx \supset Gx) \Rightarrow_q T \\
 \quad \neg \forall x(Gx \supset Fx) \Rightarrow_q T \\
 \quad \exists x \neg(Gx \supset Fx) \Rightarrow_q T \quad (V3) \\
 \quad \neg(Ga \supset Fa) \Rightarrow_{q^+} T \quad (V2) \\
 \quad \forall x(Fx \supset Gx) \Rightarrow_{q^+} T \quad (V5) \\
 \quad (Fa \supset Ga) \Rightarrow_{q^+} T \quad (V1) \\
 \quad \quad Ga \Rightarrow_{q^+} T \\
 \quad \quad \neg Fa \Rightarrow_{q^+} T \quad (Q1), (Q4), (Q3) \\
 \quad \quad \swarrow \quad \searrow \\
 \quad \neg Fa \Rightarrow_{q^+} T \quad Ga \Rightarrow_{q^+} T \quad (Q4)
 \end{array}$$

Contradiction doesn't occur, so the argument is not q -valid.

Countermodel q : Let $D = \{0\}$, $a \Rightarrow 0$, $F \Rightarrow \{\}$, $G \Rightarrow \{0\}$.

Then: $Ga \Rightarrow_q T$, because the object named by a under q has the property named by G .

And: $\neg Fa \Rightarrow_q T$, because the object named by a under q does not have the property named by F .

And: $\forall x(Fx \supset Gx) \Rightarrow_q T$, since there's only one x -variant of q , and it makes Fx false, so it makes $(Fx \supset Gx)$ true.

And: $\forall x(Gx \supset Fx) \Rightarrow_q F$, since there's only one x -variant of q , and it makes Gx true and Fx false, so it makes $(Gx \supset Fx)$ false.

$$\begin{array}{l}
 2(b) \quad \forall x(Fx \supset Gx) \Rightarrow_q T \\
 \quad \neg \forall x(\neg Gx \supset \neg Fx) \Rightarrow_q T \\
 \quad \exists x \neg(\neg Gx \supset \neg Fx) \Rightarrow_q T \quad (V3) \\
 \quad \neg(\neg Ga \supset \neg Fa) \Rightarrow_{q^+} T \quad (V2) \\
 \quad \forall x(Fx \supset Gx) \Rightarrow_{q^+} T \quad (V5) \\
 \quad (Fa \supset Ga) \Rightarrow_{q^+} T \quad (V1) \\
 \quad \quad \neg Ga \Rightarrow_{q^+} T \\
 \quad \quad \neg \neg Fa \Rightarrow_{q^+} T \quad (Q1), (Q4), (Q3) \\
 \quad \quad \swarrow \quad \searrow \\
 \quad \neg Fa \Rightarrow_{q^+} T \quad Ga \Rightarrow_{q^+} T \quad (Q4) \\
 \quad \quad * \quad \quad *
 \end{array}$$

Contradiction occurs, so the argument is q -valid.

- 3.
- | | |
|---|------------------|
| $\neg \forall x((Fx \wedge Gx) \supset (Fx \vee Gx)) \Rightarrow_q T$ | |
| $\exists x \neg((Fx \wedge Gx) \supset (Fx \vee Gx)) \Rightarrow_q T$ | (V3) |
| $\neg((Fa \wedge Ga) \supset (Fa \vee Ga)) \Rightarrow_{q^+} T$ | (V2) |
| $(Fa \wedge Ga) \Rightarrow_{q^+} T$ | |
| $\neg(Fa \vee Ga) \Rightarrow_{q^+} T$ | (Q1), (Q4), (Q3) |
| $Fa \Rightarrow_{q^+} T$ | |
| $Ga \Rightarrow_{q^+} T$ | (Q2) |
| $\neg Fa \Rightarrow_{q^+} T$ | |
| $\neg Ga \Rightarrow_{q^+} T$ | (Q1), (Q3), (Q2) |

Contradiction occurs, so there's no q -valuation that makes the negation of the *wff* true. Thus all q -valuations must make the *wff* true. Thus it's a q -logical truth.